

APPENDIX-1 STAKEHOLDER LIST

Primary Stakeholders	Description
1. Ministry of Health - Department of Public Private Partnership - General directorate of Treatment Services	Turkish Ministry of Health (MoH) underwent a process of structural and organizational change between 2010 – 2012. Because of this process the Ministry of Health wants to continue its services under the Public Private Partnership model. There are some opposing views and some disputes at the judicial level.
2. Turkish Medical Association	As a local institution the Ankara Medical Chamber and the Association of Turkish Doctors as an umbrella organization are stakeholders which must be interviewed within the scope of this project. It is well known that on August 3 rd 2012, after the Association of Turkish Doctors took legal action, the State Council had decided to suspend the execution of the Project. It is important to understand the reasons for their concerns.
3. Health Workers' Union	
4. Etlik Training and Research Hospital	The Hospital is within the Project area and used to service 2000 patients everyday; it was a 400-bed hospital with 122 doctors. Four months ago, it was closed and the staff transferred to other hospitals in Ankara.
5. Zübeyde Hanım Maternity and Child Hospital	These two hospitals are still open and they will continue to provide services during the construction of the Etlik campus. Their medical staff and patients will be affected by the project during construction. During operation they will be closed and staff transferred.
6. Dışkapı Polyclinic	
7. Patients of the thirteen Hospitals which planned for closure	The exact hospital closures associated with Etlik are currently not known but it is expected that up to 13 hospitals may close as a combined result of the Etlik and Bilkent IHC Projects. Closures are expected to occur once the Project is operating. The exception is the Etlik Specialized Hospital, which has already closed in preparation for construction.
8. Social Security Institution	The Archive unit of this institution is located on the Project site. Although other institutions have closed their building, the Social Security Institution has not moved yet.
9. SSK Public Housings' Old Residents	The Social Security Authority has 6 buildings in the project area. Users of these buildings have moved already.

Primary Stakeholders	Description
10. Mukhtars and Neighborhood residents	These parishes were users of the Etlik Training and Research Hospital which was close to them. They now have to use other hospitals. They will also be affected during the construction phase. These stakeholders are also those most likely to be served by the hospital –i.e. potential patients– once EIHCP is operational
11. First Zone • Ayvalı Parish • Varlık Parish • Aşağı Eğlence Parish • Yeniçağ Parish • Işınlar Parish • Yunus Emre Parish	
12. Local Administrations • The Metropolitan Municipality of Ankara • Municipality of Yenimahalle • Municipality of Keçiören	It is necessary to interview the local administrations to find out the social, economic and ecological positive and negative impacts of the Health Campus on the districts as well as their expectations and worries. It is necessary to question how transport will be managed and the capacity of the municipality.
13. Businesses	There are various shops possibly going to be affected by the Project, especially on the Halil Sezai Erkut street. Some of them have started to close their shops (two medical shops) because of decrease in income.
14. Construction firms and employees	Those organizations employed to work on the construction, and operation, of the EIHCP comprise a significant stakeholder group, who must be engaged once identified.
15. Other Institutions near by the project area • Directorate General For Highways • Municipality of Keçiören • Turgut Özal University • Yıldırım Beyazıt University • Gulhane Military Medical Academy	

Primary Stakeholders	Description
- Provincial Special Administration - General Directorate for State Hydraulic Works	

Secondary Stakeholders	Description
1. Transportation coordination centre (UKOME)	Possibly traffic impacts of the Project should be discussed and design of the internal and external transportation should be design with UKOME.
2. Directorates of the District Health Groups	With regard to the monopolization of the health services, it is important to know the ideas communicated by the Health Group Directorates and its related units within the scope of this project.
3. State Hospitals	Generally state hospitals give services to the middle and lower classes of society. They can easily be reached in every district and offer economic health services. Taking into consideration all these positive aspects, the centralization of the state hospitals in one area will have enormous social and economical impact. In this regard it is necessary to interview the health professionals of these institutions as well as their patients.
4. Training and Research Hospitals	In order to have interviews with the health professionals and patients, the teaching and research hospitals are very important. In addition, it is necessary to interview the educators and their assistants.
5. Specialized Hospitals	Types of specialized hospitals include trauma centres, rehabilitation, paediatric; seniors', psychiatric, cardiac, oncology and orthopaedic problems, and the campus will have some specialized hospitals. It is important to ask existing specialized hospitals opinions about the Project.
6. Universities - Ankara University Faculty of Medicine - Hacettepe University Faculty of Medicine - Başkent University Faculty of Medicine - Fatih University Faculty of Medicine	Universities have a scientific approach in dealing with patients. Therefore, as institutions they provide an objective point of view.

Secondary Stakeholders	Description
• Yıldırım Beyazıt University Faculty of Medicine	
7. Trade Unions • Trade Union of Public Employees in Health And Social Services • Trade Union of Turkish Health Workers • Heath Industry Employers' Association of Turkey • Trade Union of Revolutionary Health Workers • Trade Union of Heath Rights • Public Health and Social Service Branch Union • Trade Union of Independent Heath Workers • Trade Union of Heath Workers • Trade Union of Anatolian Health • Trade Union of Active Heath	The trade unions play an important role to find out the opinions of the members of different ideological groups and the rights of the staff working within the health care sector.
8. Civil Social Organizations • The Red Crescent • Turkish Green Crescent Society • Turkish Nurse Association • Pediatric Nurse Association • Oncologic Nurse Association • Tocology Nurse Association • Contemporary Pharmacists Association • Ankara Private Polyclinics Association • Patient And Patients' Rights Association • Doctors' Rights Association • Doctors Foundation	To find out the opinions of the groups represented by related civil social organizations within the scope of this project it will be necessary to interview them.

Secondary Stakeholders	Description
• Heath Officers Association • Heath Foundation • Heath and Social Aid Foundation • New Hope in Heath Foundation • Heath Tourism Associations • Public Private Partnership Association	
9. Political Parties • AKP • CHP • MHP • BDP	It is necessary to evaluate the political direction of political parties in Ankara with regard to the organizational changes in the health service.
10. Private Sector • Insurance companies • Tourism agencies • Private Health Enterprises	The private sector are an important stakeholder because the campus will have its own commercial area.

APPENDIX-2: LEAFLET OF THE EIHCP

What is Health Campus?

Health campuses are health centres, which perform studies about medical research and carry out in different branches. They have a complex designed as hospitals which are close to each other.

In addition to health care, health care campuses, will vary in terms of infrastructure and service facilities are designed in a way. Campuses in a high-capacity car park, green space, hotels, shopping malls and other commercial areas planned to be located.

What is Public Private Partnership (PPP)?

PPPs are arrangements between government and private sector entities for the purpose of providing public infrastructure, community facilities and related services. Such partnerships are characterized by the sharing of investment, risk, responsibility and reward between the partners. The reasons for establishing such partnerships vary but generally involve the financing, design, construction, operation and maintenance of public infrastructure



**Ankara Etlık Hastane Sağlık Hizmetleri
İşletme Yatırım A.Ş.**

İlkbahar Mahallesi
Turan Güneş Bulvarı
Galip Erdem Caddesi No:11 Yıldız
Çankaya - ANKARA/TÜRKİYE
Tel: +90 (312) 492-0306
Fax: +90 (312) 492-0306



Etlik Integrated Health Campus Project (EIHCP)

The EIHCP Project is planned to be constructed on an area of approximately 1, 07 km². The EIHCP Project comprises an integrated health campus with a total capacity of 3,566 beds besides a whole accommodates specialist hospitals with a focus on different branches such as; Cardiovascular Hospital, Orthopaedic and Neurological Sciences Hospital, Maternity Hospital, Children's Hospital, Oncology Hospital, Rehabilitation Hospital, Psychiatric Hospital and Forensic Hospital. In addition to these branches, there will also be congress center, commercial areas, high technology centre, research and development centre. Car parking area is designing underground.

Design of the Campus was prepared jointly by local architectural offices and it is going to be one of the largest hospital in the Europe and the world.

The Project is being executed by the Ministry of Health (MoH) within the scope of the Public Private Partnership (PPP) and Astaldi Türkerler joint venture has won the tender with the best offer. The Joint Venture is responsible of the design, construction and operation of the Project. Operation phase will be 25 years and MoH will be responsible of providing doctors and nurses.

HOSPITALS LOCATED WITHIN HEALTH CAMPUS AND BED CAPACITIES

TYPE OF HOSPITALS	NUMBER OF BED
General Hospital	718
Cardiovascular Hospital	362
Orthopaedic and Neurological Sciences Hospital	718
Maternity Hospital	500
Children's Hospital	508
Oncology Hospital	494
Rehabilitation Hospital	300
Psychiatric Hospital	106
Forensic Hospital	100
Total	3.566



Environmental and Social Impact Assessment

Ankara EIHCP is not in the range of Turkish EIA regulations, it is exempted from EIA process. However, concrete plant(s) with the capacity of 100 m³/hr and above are subject to the preparation of Project Introduction File (PIF) in accordance with the EIA Regulation of Turkey (Annex – II of the Regulation). Due to the fact that; separate Project Information File will be prepared. PIF documents will be presented to the Provincial Directorate of Environment and Urbanization for approval.

Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) studies have been continuing since May, 2012 and finalization of the studies are planning to be finished in July 2013. The aim of the ESIA studies are determining affected individuals and institutions and with the participation of the Project affected people minimizing negative impacts and enhancing positive impacts. The main objective of the ESIA is to ensure participation of affected people and take their opinions in the planning phase of the Project.

APPENDIX-3: DETAILS OF MEETINGS CONDUCTED DURING PHASE 1: INITIAL ENGAGEMENT

Institution	Name	Contact Details	Date	Type of meeting
PPP	Mehmet Özer	0312 573 70 32	19.11.12	In-depth Interview
Public Hospitals Institution	Faruk Koçak	0312 705 10 00	09.01.13	In-depth Interview
Public Hospitals Institution	Mehmet Demirel	0 312 705 10 00	09.01.13	In-depth Interview
General Directorate of Treatment Services	Ertuğrul Eğin	0312 585 14 64	10.01.13	In-depth Interview
Emregül Pharmacy	Gül Kırıcı	0312 321 21 29	14.01.13	FGD
Etlik Pharmacy	Yılmaz Kırıcı	0312 321 21 29	14.01.13	FGD
Ayvalı Mahalle	Şevket Özdemir	0312 344 47 48	14.01.13	FGD
Varlık Mahalle	Şükrü Damancıoğlu	0312 341 67 67	14.01.13	FGD
Küçükkev (café)	Yaşar Alkaya	0535 880 23 23	14.01.13	FGD
Küçükkev (sport complex)	Ali Demir	0532 355 40 07	14.01.13	FGD

APPENDIX-4-A DETAILS OF MEETINGS CONDUCTED DURING PHASE 2: IMPACT ASSESSMENT

Institution	Name	Contact Details	Date	Type of meeting
Ayvalı Mahalle	Şevket Özdemir	0312 344 47 48	15.04.13	Community Level Survey
Varlık Mahalle	Şükrü Damancıoğlu	0535 346 60 19	15.04.13	Community Level Survey
Aşağı Mahalle	Necati Sorgut	0533 338 77 69	15.04.13	Community Level Survey
Yeniçağ Mahalle	Fehmi Uzun	0533 711 70 20	15.04.13	Community Level Survey
Işınlar Mahalle	Yaşar Kalkan	0535 280 45 95	15.04.13	Community Level Survey
Yunusemre Mahalle	Zekariya Özdemir	0536 777 77 32	15.04.13	Community Level Survey
Emregül Pharmacy	Gül Kırıcı	0312 321 21 29	16.04.13	Business Questionnaire
Küçükev-Güzelbahçe	Yaşar Alkaya	0312 321 79 79	16.04.13	Business Questionnaire
Goya Canteen	Ümit Yaylacı	0544 747 87 14	16.04.13	Business Questionnaire
Taxi Stand	Zafert Toraman Bayram Tuncel Erdal Yıldırım Eyüp Şengül Cebrail Alıcı	0312 352 14 14	16.04.13	Business Questionnaire
Kumrucum (Kiosk)	Erol Pekesen	0536 813 33 71		Business Questionnaire
Turkish Medical Association	Özgür Erbaş	0312 231 31 79	29.03.13	In-depth Interview
Yıldırım Beyazıt University	Hasan Demirel	0546 205 51 20	17.04.13	In-depth Interview
Turgut Özal University	Yakup Yıldız	0312 551 50 33	18.04.13	In-depth Interview

**APPENDIX-4-B: ATTENDEES LIST OF PUBLIC PARTICIPATION MEETING IN
PHASE 2: IMPACT ASSESSMENT**

1. Name	Institution	Occupation
2. Sencan Ünal	Antares	Retired
3. Doğa Yazman	Antares	Economist
4. Nazan Önal	Antares	Marketing
5. Yaşar Alkaya	Küçükev	Owner
6. Ali Dönmez	Küçükev	Operating Manager
7. Murat Yücedağ	Küçükev	Manager of Amusement Park
8. Mert Kara	Küçükev	Manager of Sport Complex
9. Nusret Sönmez	Taxi Stand	Taxi Driver
10. Veli Karabiber	Taxi Stand	Taxi Driver
11. Zafer Toraman	Taxi Stand	Taxi Driver
12. İsa Gümüş	Pharmacy	Technical
13. Nejla Yaşayanlar	Resident	Housewife
14. Zekeriya Özdemir	Mukhtar	Mukhtar
15. Ege Yaşayanlar	–	-
16. Murat Yaşayanlar	–	Architect
17. Adnan Onar	–	Construction Engineer
18. Çağla Onar	–	Housewife
19. Ebru Yıldız	EBRD	Environmental Engineer
20. Cihan Barut	SPV	Economist
21. Serhat İnanç	SPV	Economist
22. Feray Artar	Ankara University	Academic Personnel
23. Elçin Kaya	2U1K	Sociologist
24. Mutlu Erdem	2U1K	Environmental Engineer
25. Günel Özenirler	2U1K	Environmental Engineer
26. Tufan Hüyük	2U1K	Environmental Engineer
27. Emra Kaya	2U1K	Environmental Engineer

APPENDIX -5: STAKEHOLDER OPINIONS AND CONCERNS ABOUT THE PROJECT

This appendix provides a summary of the main concerns, expectations and recommendations presented by stakeholders during engagement activities for the Project.

Concerns of Stakeholders

- Traffic load will be increased; resulting from additional construction vehicles on already busy commuter roads.
- There is expected to be a large number of people using the site on a daily basis.
- Construction period of the campuses will create environmental pollution; resulting from excavation works and the exhaust of machinery and vehicles used during the construction phase, resulting from construction traffic and machinery, especially during activities such as excavation and drilling.
- Associated with an influx of approx. 4,000 construction workers, many living in worker (temporary) accommodation near the site.
- Trespassers onto the construction site may be at risk serious accident or injury if they come near construction activities or vehicles.
- Concerns over the protection of the tumulus (a mound of earth and stones raised over an ancient grave) on site, which was known by residents on the nearby mahalles.
- Prices of houses will increase;
- Lack of car parking;
- Noise, dust and pollution problems associated with construction;
- Decreasing the level of income for private hospitals;
- PPP model is privatization of health services. State have to protect all citizen's life right and provision of health services is the most important need for public;
- Transparency of the tender process for hospital contracts.
- Healthcare services should be accessible and free to all;
- The relationship between the MoH and the private sector.
- Etlik Specialized Hospital canteen. 2 additional businesses will also be affected (a taxi stand and leisure complex)

Expectations of Stakeholders

- Job opportunities;
- Improved access to health services;
- Increased income for local businesses;
- Economic benefits to the local economy;
- Improved access to health care and the provision of a new, state of the art medical facility for a large proportion of the Ankara population, specially elderly population
- Improved infrastructure.

Recommendations of Stakeholders

- The need for adequate security measures;
- The need for construction of the subway to be completed as soon as possible;
- Careful siting of the temporary workers camp away from residential areas;
- Hiring of local people;
- Traffic awareness campaign for local people;
- Sufficient road network.

APPENDIX-6: SAMPLE OF GRIEVANCE CLOSEOUT FORM

Note: you can remain anonymous if you prefer or request not to disclose your identity to the third parties without your consent

Grievance closeout number:		
Define immediate action required:		
Define long term action required (if necessary):		
Compensation Required?	☐ YES ☐ NO	
CONTROL OF THE REMEDIATE ACTION AND THE DECISION		
Stages of the Remediate Action		Deadline and Responsible Institutions
1.		
2.		
3.		
4.		
5.		
6.		
7.		
8.		

COMPENSATION AND FINAL STAGES

This part will be filled and signed by the complainant after s/he receives the compensation fees and his/her complaint has been remediated.

Notes:

Name-Surname and Signature

Date.... / /

Of the Complainant:
Institution/Company

Representative of the Responsible
Title-Name-Surname and Signature

APPENDIX-7 SAMPLE OF GRIEVANCE FORM

Note: you can remain anonymous if you prefer or request not to disclose your identity to the third parties without your consent.

Reference No		
Full Name		
Please mark how you wish to be contacted (mail, telephone, e-mail).	☐ By Post: Please provide mailing address ☐ By telephone:..... ☐ By e-mail:.....	
Province/Town/Settlement		
Date		
Category of the Grievance		
1. On abandonment (hospital, public housing)		
2. On assets/properties impacted by the project		
3. On infrastructure		
4. On decrease or complete loss of sources of income		
5. On environmental issues (like pollution)		
6. On employment		
7. On traffic, transportation and other risks		
9-Other (Please specify):		

Description of the Grievance What did happen? When did it happen? Where did it happen? What is the result of the problem?

What would you like to see happen to resolve the problem?

Signature:

Date

APPENDIX-8: PUBLIC PARTICIPATION MEETING ATTENDANCE SHEET

ETLİK ENTEGRE SAĞLIK KAMPÜSÜ PROJESİ HALKIN KATILIMI VE PAYDAŞ BİLGİLENDİRME TOPLANTISI KATILIMCI LİSTESİ
21 Nisan 2013

İSİM	KURUM	MESLEK	TELEFON	ADRES
Yiğençer Ünal	—	Emekli	05354049141	
Doğan Yazman	ERNST AND YOUNG	İKTİSAT	05358106333	Faaliyet Is merkezi No: 5455 GAMBAR / ANKARA
Nazım Oral	Antares	Pazarlamacı	05327740486	Antares AVM 4000m
YATIRAKAYA	Küçükçekirten Spor Kompleksi	Sahibi		
Ali Dönmez	Küçükçekirten Spor Kompleksi	Yönetim Kurulu	05223584007	
Murat Uğurdor	Küçükçekirten Spor Kompleksi	Yönetim Kurulu		
Mert Kaya	Küçükçekirten Spor Kompleksi	Yönetim Kurulu		
Musrrup Samancı	Taksi duragi	ULASIM	0535-489-3358	
YERİ KARABİR	Taksi duragi		05332110351	
Zafer Toraman	Ulasim		05316489317	
İsmail GİMİZ	ELZANE	ECZ-Telenor	05323876505	ANTARES AVM
Nilüfer Yavaşlar	Emekli	Buhanın		
Ege Yavaşlar		Göçmen		
Murat Yavaşlar		Mimar		
Adnan Öner		İşletme Mühendisi		
Gökçe Öner		Eğitmen		
Emre Yıldız	EBRD		+44 797 693 2038	E. Yıldız

ETLİK ENTEGRE SAĞLIK KAMPÜSÜ PROJESİ HALKIN KATILIMI VE PAYDAŞ BİLGİLENDİRME TOPLANTISI KATILIMCI LİSTESİ
21 Nisan 2013

[illegible]