

MONITORING AND EVALUATION

8	Monitoring and Evaluation	8-1
8.1	Objectives.....	8-1
8.2	RAP Monitoring Framework.....	8-1
8.3	Expert Monitoring.....	8-3
8.4	Monitoring Program.....	8-4
8.5	Reporting.....	8-5
8.6	Staff and Resources.....	8-5
8.7	RAP Completion Audit.....	8-6

LIST OF TABLES

Table 8.1	Summary of RAP Monitoring Reports.....	8-5
Table 8.2	BTC RAP Monitoring Framework.....	8-6

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 8.1	Monitoring Program.....	8-4
------------	-------------------------	-----

8 MONITORING AND EVALUATION

8.1 OBJECTIVES

The purpose of resettlement monitoring in Georgia will be to verify that:

- Actions and commitments described in the RAP are implemented fully and on time;
- Eligible affected people receive their full compensation entitlements within agreed timeframes;
- RAP actions and compensation measures are effective in sustainably enhancing (or at least restoring) affected peoples' living standards and income levels;
- Complaints and grievances lodged by project affected people are followed up and that where necessary, appropriate corrective actions are implemented; and
- If necessary, changes in RAP procedure are made to improve delivery of entitlements to project affected people.

For the BTC pipeline in Georgia, primary monitoring responsibility will rest with BTC Co. BTC Co. will establish an Environmental and Social (E&S) Department to undertake social and environmental monitoring for the project. The E&S Department will receive training from a resettlement specialist on basic monitoring techniques and reporting requirements for the RAP. BTC Co. will also support expert monitoring by a panel of consultants as described in Section 8.4.

8.2 RAP MONITORING FRAMEWORK

There are three components of the monitoring framework for the BTC pipeline in Georgia:

- Internal monitoring by BTC Co's E&S Department
- Monitoring by a three-person panel of expert consultants
- RAP Completion Audit by the Expert Monitoring Panel.

The scope of each type of monitoring is briefly described in the following sections.

The establishment of appropriate indicators in the RAP is essential since what is measured is what will be considered important. Indicators will be created for affected people as a whole, for key stakeholder groups, and for special categories of affected groups such as women, children, the elderly, and those who are particularly poor. Key performance indicators for monitoring are commonly divided into five categories for World Bank financed activities:

- **Input** indicators include the resources in terms of people, equipment and materials that go into the RAP. Examples of input indicators in the RAP include: (i) the sources and amounts of funding for various RAP activities; and (ii) the establishment of the Land Acquisition Team.
- **Output** indicators concern the activities and services, which are produced with the inputs. Examples of output indicators in the RAP include (i) a database for tracking individual plot compensation; (ii) increased agricultural production to offset income losses caused by the project; and (iii) the payment of compensation for loss of land or assets.

- **Process** indicators represent the change in the quality and quantity of access and coverage of the activities and services. Examples of process indicators in the RAP include: (i) the creation of grievance mechanisms; (ii) the establishment of stakeholder channels so that they can participate in RAP implementation; (iii) information dissemination activities; and (iv) establishment of the BTC community investment program.
- **Outcome**¹ indicators include the delivery of compensation and other mitigation to avoid economic and physical displacement caused by the project. They measure whether compensation is paid and received, whether the affected populations were able to use compensation payment for investments that would give them sustained income. Examples of outcome indicators include:
 - restoration of agricultural production and overall income levels;
 - participation levels in Community Investment Programs;
 - successfully negotiated land agreements;
 - satisfaction with reinstatement activities;
 - changes in community attitudes towards the project;
 - types of use of compensation payments for income generating investments.
- **Impact** indicators assess the change in medium and long-term measurable results in behaviour, living standards and associated conditions. The aim is to establish whether (i) the RAP is effective in maintaining (or restoring) on social and economic conditions, especially on social groups such as women and the elderly, and on social institutions such as the family and communities; (ii) social groups, families and individuals included in the RAP are able to restore and maintain their incomes and livelihoods. Examples of impact indicators include (i) restoration of income levels for groups and regions affected by the pipeline; (ii) the assessment of whether outcomes can be maintained over the medium and long-term.

The most important indicators for the RAP in the near term concern outputs, processes and outcomes since they define whether the planned level of effort is being made and whether early implementation experience is being used to modify/redesign RAP features. Over the medium to long term, outcome and impact indicators are critical since they are the ultimate measure of the RAP's effectiveness in restoring people's livelihoods. Specific performance indicators will be established and field-tested in consultation with affected people and other stakeholders to ensure that they are effective, efficient, objective and relevant to the RAP.

8.1 INTERNAL RAP MONITORING

Internal monitoring will focus on measuring progress against the schedule of actions defined in the RAP. Activities to be undertaken by the BTC E&S Department will include:

- liaison with the Land Acquisition Team, construction contractor and project affected communities to review and report progress against the RAP;

¹ The outcome of the RAP in restoring incomes and livelihoods will require a variety of indicators given the differences in the baseline conditions among the three broad regional groupings, and the many sub-regional characteristics of the affected people along the length of the pipeline in Turkey. A challenge for the baseline reporting and for the participatory establishment of the M&E indicators is to determine which indicators are most appropriate for particular situations. This may result in a variety of indicators for different groups, areas, and development levels.

- verification that land acquisition and compensation entitlements are being delivered in accordance with the RAP;
- verification that agreed measures to restore or enhance living standards are being implemented;
- verification that agreed measures to restore or enhance livelihood are being implemented;
- identification of any problems, issues, or cases of hardship resulting from the resettlement process;
- through informal village head and household interviews, assess project affected peoples' satisfaction with resettlement outcomes;
- collate records of grievances, follow-up that appropriate corrective actions have been undertaken and that outcomes are satisfactory; and,
- prepare brief quarterly progress and compliance reports for BTC Management and the Expert RAP Monitoring Panel.

8.3 EXPERT MONITORING

BTC Co. will engage a three-person panel of consultants to undertake six monthly reviews of project resettlement in order to achieve the following:

- To assess overall compliance with the RAP;
- To verify that measures to restore or enhance project affected peoples' quality of life and livelihood are being implemented and to gauge their effectiveness; and
- To assess the extent to which the quality of life and livelihoods of affected communities have been restored.

Activities that will be undertaken by the consultants include:

- (i) review of internal monitoring procedures and reporting to ascertain whether these are being undertaken in compliance with the RAP;
 - (ii) review internal monitoring records as a basis for identifying any areas of non-compliance, any recurrent problems, or potentially disadvantaged groups or households;
 - (iii) review grievance records for evidence of significant non-compliance or recurrent poor performance in resettlement implementation;
 - (iv) discussions with BTC Co E&S Department staff, and others involved in land acquisition, compensation disbursement or livelihood restoration to review progress and identify critical issues;
 - (v) survey affected households and enterprises to gauge the extent to which project affected people's standards of living and livelihood have been restored or enhanced as a result of the project;
 - (vi) assess overall compliance with the RAP requirements and OD 4.30; and,
-

- (vii) prepare a summary compliance report for BTC Co Management on resettlement progress, any issues arising and any necessary corrective actions.

8.4 MONITORING PROGRAM

Timing for monitoring activities is summarised in Figure 8.1

Based on the current project implementation schedule, internal monitoring will commence in the first quarter of 2003 with the first Internal Monitoring Report to be produced by end of March 2003. The first Expert RAP Monitoring Panel review will commence in the second quarter of 2003 with the first Expert RAP Monitoring Panel Report to be produced by mid-year 2003.

Both internal and expert RAP monitoring will continue until the RAP Completion Audit is finished.

Figure 8.1 Monitoring Program

ID	Task Name	2003				2004				2005				2006				2007				2008			
		Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
1	Internal Monitoring																								
2	Expert Monitoring	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
3	Completion Audit																								◆
4	Land Acquisition/Compensation																								
5	BTC Construction																								
6	SCP Construction																								

8.5 REPORTING

RAP monitoring reports will be prepared in accordance with Table 8.1.

Table 8.1 Summary of RAP Monitoring Reports

Monitoring Report Type	Frequency	Prepared By	For	Comment
Internal RAP Monitoring Report	Quarterly	BTC E&S Department	BTC Co Management Team. (may also be reviewed by Expert RAP Monitoring Panel during 6-monthly reviews)	10-15 page report (plus supporting documentation) summarising progress against the RAP; outline of any issues and agreed related actions; summary schedule of grievance status; minutes of any stakeholder or affected people consultations or meetings
Expert RAP Monitoring Report	Six monthly	Expert RAP Monitoring Panel, comprising 3 international resettlement consultants	BTC Co. Board	25-35 page report (plus supporting documentation) summarising assessment of progress towards living standard restoration, livelihood restoration; <i>OD 4.30</i> compliance; discussion of any RAP issues of concerns; identification of any areas of non-compliance and agreed corrective actions; and summary of resettlement status.
RAP Completion Audit Report	One-off, 36 months following construction completion or at such time as Expert RAP Monitoring Panel assesses living standards & livelihoods restoration is complete	Expert RAP Monitoring Panel	BTC Co. Board	RAP Completion Audit to verify that BTC Co. has complied with undertakings defined by the RAP and that land acquisition and compensation has been completed in compliance with <i>OD 4.30</i> principles.

The findings of the six-monthly monitoring reports and RAP completion audit will be made publicly available.

8.6 STAFF AND RESOURCES

Staff in the BTC E&S Department will receive training from a resettlement specialist to cover: (i) project resettlement requirements as defined by this RAP; (ii) monitoring indicators to be used; (iii) basic techniques to be used for collecting information and feedback from project affected people; and (iii) reporting requirements and formats.

The BTC E&S Department will have 3 international and approximately 12 local staff with social and environmental expertise. The RAP Monitoring Team will be managed by the Social Supervisor who will have extensive in-country experience, thorough knowledge of local social conditions and familiarity with local NGO networks. The Social Supervisor will be assisted by a minimum of three field staff (male and female).

8.7 RAP COMPLETION AUDIT

A key objective of the RAP is that resettlement actions and mitigatory measures should lead to sustainable restoration or enhancement of affected people's pre-project living standards and income levels. At such time as affected peoples' quality of life and livelihood can be demonstrated to have been sustainably restored, the resettlement process can be deemed "complete".

In Georgia, resettlement planning for the BTC pipeline assumes that livelihood restoration of affected landowners will be complete when the productivity of agricultural land affected by pipeline construction has been fully restored and community and social investment programs are well established. This is anticipated to occur within three years of pipeline construction completion². By this time, three seasons' cultivation should have restored soil structure, organic content and nutrient status to pre-project conditions. It is proposed, therefore, that the resettlement completion audit be conducted by the Expert RAP Monitoring Panel 36 months following pipeline construction completion or at such time as the Expert RAP Monitoring Panel determines affected people's living standards and income levels have been fully restored, whichever occurs earliest.

Table 8.2 BTC RAP Monitoring Framework

BTC RAP Monitoring Framework				
Monitoring Indicator	Measures	Monitoring Frequency	Duration	Monitoring Responsibility
Performance against RAP	Progress in signing land acquisition agreements - % complete	Monthly	Land acquisition commencement to RAP Completion Audit	Land Acquisition Team, BTC E&S Department
	Payment of compensation entitlements - % complete			
	Land parcels in possession of contractor – number, percent of total			
	Reinstatement - % complete			
	Amended land ownership certificates issued - % complete			
	Social Investment activities initiated - list			
	Grievance process – no. of grievances lodged/ actioned/ closed out			
	Consultation activities – log of activities, minutes			
Monitoring – log of activities				
Restoration of Living Standards	Was compensation paid to landowners?	Monthly	Land acquisition commencement to Construction Completion	Land Acquisition Team, BTC E&S Department, Expert RAP
	Was compensation paid to leaseholders?			
	Was compensation paid to other users?			
	Was compensation in line with agreed rates and on-time?			
	Were other entitlements delivered?			

² This assumes that SCP gas pipeline construction occurs immediately after BTC pipeline construction is completed.

RESETTLEMENT ACTION PLAN
GEORGIA

BTC RAP Monitoring Framework				
Monitoring Indicator	Measures	Monitoring Frequency	Duration	Monitoring Responsibility
	Did affected enterprises receive entitlements? Did enterprise employees receive entitlements? Were land attachments (fences, roads, wells, irrigation channels, drains, etc) fully reinstated? Have special needs of vulnerable groups been addressed?			Monitoring Panel
Restoration of Income and Livelihood	To what extent have pre-project activities resumed within the pipeline corridor? What yields are being achieved? To what extent have fruit trees, vineyards and other perennial crops been replanted? How many project affected households have received agricultural assistance through the project? What changes have occurred in the cost of living of affected people? Have income changes kept pace with cost of living? What changes have occurred in income and expenditure patterns compared to pre-project situation? How have special needs of vulnerable groups been met? How many project affected households have received micro-credit services? No. of skilled and unskilled project affected people engaged in construction workforce Are livelihood restoration measures proving effective? Are additional supporting measures required?	Six monthly	Land acquisition commencement to RAP Completion Audit	BTC E&S Department, Expert RAP Monitoring Panel,
Monitoring Indicator	Measures	Monitoring Frequency	Duration	Monitoring Responsibility
Levels of PAP satisfaction	How do PAPs assess the extent to which their quality of life and livelihood has been restored? Have PAPs experienced any hardship as a result of the project?	Ongoing		BTC E&S Department, Expert RAP Monitoring Panel
Consultation and Grievances	Do PAPs understand the land acquisition and compensation process? Do PAPs understand avenues for expressing a grievance? What types of grievances have been identified and what were outcomes?	Ongoing		BTC E&S Department, Expert RAP Monitoring Panel

Abbreviations: RAP: Resettlement Action Plan PAP: Project Affected Population